

April 2, 2002

G:\sab\minutes\fy2002min\EC-PM 03282MIN.wpd

PM RESEARCH CENTERS INTERIM REVIEW PANEL

Conference Call

11:00-12:00 Eastern Standard Time

March 28, 2002

Panel Members Present:

Mr. Dan Greenbaum, Chair -- also connected by PlaceWare for real-time editing
Dr. Michael Brauer -- also connected by PlaceWare for real-time editing
Dr. Bert Brunekreef
Dr. Kenneth Donaldson
Dr. Carol Henry
Dr. Paul Liroy
Dr. Maria Morandi -- also connected by PlaceWare for real-time editing
Dr. Ronald Wyzga

Panel Members Absent:

Dr. Patrick Kinney
Dr. Shankar Prasad

Designated Federal Officer

Dr. Donald Barnes -- also connected by PlaceWare for real-time editing

Others on the line

Ms. Stacey Katz, Office of Research and Development, USEPA

1. Introduction

a. PlaceWare

Dr. Greenbaum opened the meeting and explained that the Panel was experimenting with new technology that would permit real-time, on-line editing of the report. (The experiment showed some promise, but the slow appearance of typed information on the screen took some getting-used-to. Unfortunately, the system frozen up before the Panel had much of a chance to sharpen its skills. The process seems to be pregnant with possibilities. More training and experience will help the process in the future.)

b. Dr. Prasad

The Chair had communicated with Dr. Prasad about the latter's concerns in some detail. Mr. Greenbaum reported that Dr. Prasad's concerns about reproducing some of the results at some of the Centers had not been meant to signal significant displeasure with the report. He did not want his comments to be over-interpreted. Mr. Greenbaum noted that, in fact, too much collaboration among the centers could bring the independent ability of the Centers to replicate each others work into question. Mr. Greenbaum had added language to the summary and to body of the report in order to address Dr. Prasad's concern.

c. Dr. Hopke

The Chair announced that Dr. Hopke had resigned from the Panel after receiving and

accepting an invitation from the Rochester PM Research Center to assume the role of director of the monitoring and chemistry activities of the Center. Dr. Barnes, after conferring with Mr. Greenbaum and the Chair of the SAB Executive Committee, Dr. William Glaze, had accepted the resignation with regret, but with an understanding and appreciation of the ethical/conflict-of-interest considerations that led up to Dr. Hopke's decision. The Panel roster in the report will refer to Dr. Hopke's participation in the meeting and to early development of the report. It will note that Dr. Hopke is not a party to the report *per se*.

2. Discussion of the report

The participants engaged in an active discussion of the report, including the following points:

a. Executive Summary

In light of the substantive transmittal letter and the shortness of the report, the Panel agreed that an Executive Summary is not needed.

b. p. 7, line 7 (last sentence of paragraph)

Dr. Wyzga commented that the reference to multiple panel studies in the last clause was not really accurate. The Panel agreed to remove the last clause.

c. p. 7, line 37

The Panel decided to drop the phrase "in some cases by a factor of 10", since there was not a firm reference for the statement, and it seemed to bring a perhaps arguable quantitative focus to what was basically the consensus qualitative argument that the Panel wanted to make.

d. p. 9, line 21-34

The Panel agreed that the stuck-out portion (lines 24-24), dealing with interaction between the Center participants and other scientists, should be retained as a stand-alone item and not incorporated as a subpoint in the list just above (lines 21-22).

e. p. 12, circa line 38

There was considerable discussion about whether there is a problem or a potential problem that would benefit from additional peer review of Center studies. A consensus emerged that informal peer review/involvement among the Centers is going on now and that formalizing such involvement would likely be a detriment, rather than a benefit. Suitable language was agreed upon for the final report.

f. p. 12, point 3, beginning on line 42

The Panel agreed to mention the Supersites as one example of "intensive air quality monitoring efforts", a description that would also include some of the NARSTO activities. Further, the group decided to include this point in the list of "opportunities for continued benefits and improvement" that begins on p. 8, line 40 as the next-to-last item in the list that concludes on p. 9.

g. p. 22, line 18

Dr. Wyzga questioned whether membership on the Science Advisory Committees, *per se*, should be intended to serve as a communication tool with the local community and state and local agencies, as the current text suggests. The Panel agreed that the language about adding local officials to the SAC should be replaced with a suggestion for enhanced outreach and communication with state and local air agencies.

h. DFO questions

The Panel went through the report and gave consensus guidance to the DFO for each of the points that he had raised in the body of the text.

3. Approval of the report

a. There was a consensus that all members of the Panel can approve the report, subject to the edits discussed at this meeting. There are no outstanding issues.

b. The DFO was instructed to

1) Edit the report in accordance with the discussion at this meeting.

2) Post the final, edited report on the SAB Website.

3) Send the specific URL of the report to the Panel members.

4) Solicit their formal approval of the report by email.

c. The report will be sent to the SAB Executive Committee (EC) in early April and discussed in a publicly accessible conference call on May 8, as one of five reports from SAB Panels that will be acted upon by the EC between 11:00-1:00 Eastern Daylight Time.

4. Adjournment

The Chair concluded the meeting at 11:50 with a statement of appreciation on behalf of himself and the SAB, and a special thank you to DFO Donald Barnes for his work with this Panel, and for his many years of exemplary service with the SAB.

Respectfully submitted,

Concurred,

/ Signed /

/ Signed /

Donald G. Barnes
Designated Federal Officer

Daniel Greenbaum
Panel Chair